

Master of Science (Surgical Research)
Criteria for independent study evaluation

In order to pass the defense, all criteria must be in “good” condition

In addition to all the following criteria, the final independent study must meet all the criteria of the graduate college in order to fulfill the graduation requirement.

A. Title	Good	Fair	Poor	N/A
A1. The title summarizes main idea simply within 15 words.				
A2. The title is fully explanatory when standing alone.				
A3. Every word in the title serves a useful purpose.				
A4. There is no abbreviation in the title.				
B. Abstract				
B1. Abstract provides a brief, comprehensive summary of the independent study.				
B2. Abstract contains research problem, methods, key findings, conclusion, and implications or applications.				
B3. Abstract does not contain information that does not appear in the independent study.				
B4. All abbreviations and acronyms used in the abstract are clearly defined.				
B5. The abstract contains only four or five important concepts, and findings. The most important information is presented first.				
B6. The abstract contains no more than 350 words.				
C. Table of content				
C1. All key sections have been listed in table of content (Introduction, literature review, method, results, discussion)				
C2. All pages are listed correctly.				
C3. List of tables includes all the tables shown in the independent study, with correct page numbers.				
C4. List of figures includes all the figures shown in the independent study, with correct page numbers.				
C5. List of abbreviations shows all abbreviations used in the independent study with correct spelling.				

D. Introduction	Good	Fair	Poor	N/A
D1. The introduction contains all critical parts: background, conceptual framework, research questions, purposes of the study, research hypothesis, scope of the study, significance of the study, definitions of key terms, ethical considerations				
D2. The research question is good: feasible, clear, significance, ethical				
D3. The problem under investigation is relevant to surgery.				
D4. The conceptual framework being used is appropriate and up-to-date.				
E. Literature review				
E1. The literature review provides appropriate history of the problem being investigated in a concise manner.				
E2. The literature review contains all pertinent literature related to research problem. The review shows correct understanding of the concepts being investigated.				
E3. The literature review does not contain unimportant literature (i.e., the works that only tangentially related to the research problem).				
E4. Controversial issues have been addressed fairly. The literature review is written in an unbiased, professional manner.				
E5. All terms used in the literature review are consistent (i.e., does not use different words to show the same idea in different parts of literature review).				
E6. All key variables under investigation have been critically reviewed.				
E7. All key instruments being discussed in the study have been critically reviewed.				
F. Methods				
F1. The scope of the investigation is appropriately selected and is described clearly.				
F2. The criteria for selection of research studies for critical review have been described clearly.				
F3. The number of research studies that have been reviewed is appropriate.				
F4. All relevant information has been extracted from the reviewed studies in a concise manner.				
F5. The procedure for critical appraisal of the quality of the reviewed study is completely described and appropriate.				

G. Results	Good	Fair	Poor	N/A
G1. All the research questions have been answered properly.				
G2. All the statistics are reported appropriately according to an international standard.				
G3. All statistical indices have been interpreted correctly.				
G4. The data have been reported in sufficient detail to justify the conclusion.				
G5. No discussion of the implications of the findings in the results section.				
G6. Tables and/or graphs have been used properly.				
G7. No repetition of the same data in multiple places.				
G8. All tables and figures have been mentioned in the text.				
G9. All data have been reported in a fair, accurate, and responsible manner.				
H. Discussion				
H1. Clear statement whether the research findings support the hypotheses has been made.				
H2. Theoretical consequences of the research findings have been discussed.				
H3. Discussion about similarities and differences between the findings of the study and pertinent studies in the field has been done.				
H4. No repetition of the same statement/message from prior sections with no new insight is done.				
H5. Limitations of the study are acknowledged.				
H6. Implications of the study to surgical practice have been discussed, but without going beyond what the study warrants.				
H7. Appropriate suggestions for future research have been made.				
I. References				
I1. All the references being cited within the text appear in the reference list.				
I2. All the references in the reference list have been cited in the text of the independent study.				
I3. The reference citation style is conformed with Vancouver style.				
J. Appendices				
J1. All key materials of the study appear in the appendices: questionnaires, research instruments.				
J2. Full credits of copyright holder have been made clear.				